# The Macroeconomics of Debt Overhang

Thomas Philippon
Discussant: Mark Aguiar

November 5, 2009

# Debt Overhang

- Outstanding stock of debt depresses investment
  - Dilutes returns
  - Weakens credibility
- May occur even when contracts are efficient

### **Policy Questions**

- One important policy issue: How to provide aid to countries or individuals with debt overhang
- Reduce debt (debt forgiveness or debt "buy backs")
- Give direct transfers

# Buy Back Boondoggle

- Bulow and Rogoff demonstrated that even in the presence of debt overhang, direct transfers dominate buy backs.
- ▶ The buy backs leak back to creditors
- More generally, the best way to raise welfare is to expand the budget set rather than make decisions on behalf of the recipient
  - Mimic missing insurance markets
  - Avoid pitfalls of paternalism

# Buy Backs Reconsidered

- ► That transfers dominate debt buybacks not robust to reasonable modeling alternatives
  - Political Economy of Sovereign Debt (Amador; Aguiar and Amador)
  - Externality (this paper): bailouts of households can backfire
- Key insight: "Participation" brings some additional benefits and policy needs to raise the incentive to "opt in."

### BC vs. IC

- Budget Sets versus Incentive Constraints
  - ▶ If incentive constraint binds, return to relaxing incentive constraint is positive and should influence how aid is given.
  - Expanding budget set is no longer sole objective.
  - Often can combine the two (debt restructuring).

### Incentive Constraints

 $\begin{array}{c} \mathsf{Benefits} \ \mathsf{of} \\ \mathsf{Participation} \end{array} \gtrless \begin{array}{c} \mathsf{Benefits} \ \mathsf{of} \\ \mathsf{Opting} \ \mathsf{Out} \ (\mathsf{Default}) \end{array}$ 

### Cash Transfers

 $\begin{array}{ccc} \text{Benefits of} & & & \text{Benefits of} \\ \text{Participation} & & & \text{Opting Out (Default)} \\ & & & & & & & \\ \hline \textbf{Cash Transfer} & & \textbf{Cash Transfer} \end{array}$ 

### **Debt Forgiveness**

Benefits of Participation ≥ Benefits of Opting Out (Default)

↑

Debt Forgiveness

### Moving beyond Aid to External Effects

- Nature of the novel externality:
  - ▶ Private Gain: Pay Debt ⇒ Participate in investment projects and receive payment on assets
  - ► Externality: Pay Debt ⇒ Raise return to financial assets ⇒ Raise incentive for others to participate
- Paying debt is not just a transfer (and with linear utility pure transfers are uninteresting).
- Paying debt relaxes IC constraint of everyone else (gets closer to efficient level of investment)

### Global Bailouts

- ▶ In global setting, individual countries view bailouts like Bulow-Rogoff – transfer abroad
- ▶ Do not internalize effect on IC constraints of others
- ▶ Role for coordination

### Conclusion

- Very nice framework to study external effects of debt overhang
- ► Helps move focus of policy making from budget sets (missing insurance markets) to IC constraints