Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

Hiau Looi Kee and Heiwai Tang

World Bank and Tufts University

December 2011

The findings and results of this paper do not represent the views of the World Bank, its Executive Directors, or the countries they represent

1 / 32

Designed by Apple in California, Assembled in China







• The widening bilateral imbalance in US-China trade has attracted a lot of heated discussions, mainly focus on the US labor market impact of Chinese exports

- The widening bilateral imbalance in US-China trade has attracted a lot of heated discussions, mainly focus on the US labor market impact of Chinese exports
- Autor, Dorn and Hanson (2011) find that Chinese imports into the US significantly lower job creation, wages, and labor market participation

- The widening bilateral imbalance in US-China trade has attracted a lot of heated discussions, mainly focus on the US labor market impact of Chinese exports
- Autor, Dorn and Hanson (2011) find that Chinese imports into the US significantly lower job creation, wages, and labor market participation
- Scott (2011): "growing US trade deficit with China costs 2.8 million jobs between 2001 and 2010."

• China being the "factory of the World," due to its participation in the global production chain, particularly at the final assembly stage

- China being the "factory of the World," due to its participation in the global production chain, particularly at the final assembly stage
- While many products are "made in China", they embody inputs from around the world

- China being the "factory of the World," due to its participation in the global production chain, particularly at the final assembly stage
- While many products are "made in China", they embody inputs from around the world
- For Apple's iPod, only US\$4 out of its value of US\$150 can be attributable to producers located in China, with the rest being created mostly in the US, Japan, and Korea (Dedrick, Kraemer and Linden, 2009)

- China being the "factory of the World," due to its participation in the global production chain, particularly at the final assembly stage
- While many products are "made in China", they embody inputs from around the world
- For Apple's iPod, only US\$4 out of its value of US\$150 can be attributable to producers located in China, with the rest being created mostly in the US, Japan, and Korea (Dedrick, Kraemer and Linden, 2009)
- Majority of Chinese exports are under the processing trade regime, whereby firms in China import materials or parts to be further assembled, processed and exported

- China being the "factory of the World," due to its participation in the global production chain, particularly at the final assembly stage
- While many products are "made in China", they embody inputs from around the world
- For Apple's iPod, only US\$4 out of its value of US\$150 can be attributable to producers located in China, with the rest being created mostly in the US, Japan, and Korea (Dedrick, Kraemer and Linden, 2009)
- Majority of Chinese exports are under the processing trade regime, whereby firms in China import materials or parts to be further assembled, processed and exported
- Domestic value added in Chinese exports may be far less than actual gross exports

- 4 回 ト - 4 回 ト



.2/11 6 / 32

• This paper provides evidence on the trend and the pattern of the domestic value added in Chinese exports

- This paper provides evidence on the trend and the pattern of the domestic value added in Chinese exports
- Existing research includes Chen, Chang, Fung and Lau (2001), Hummels, Ishii and Yi (2001), Koopman, Wang and Wei (2008), and Koopman, Powers, Wang and Wei (2010), Johnson and Noguera (forthcoming)

- This paper provides evidence on the trend and the pattern of the domestic value added in Chinese exports
- Existing research includes Chen, Chang, Fung and Lau (2001), Hummels, Ishii and Yi (2001), Koopman, Wang and Wei (2008), and Koopman, Powers, Wang and Wei (2010), Johnson and Noguera (forthcoming)
- These studies mainly rely on input-output tables at the sector level to assess foreign content in Chinese exports

- This paper provides evidence on the trend and the pattern of the domestic value added in Chinese exports
- Existing research includes Chen, Chang, Fung and Lau (2001), Hummels, Ishii and Yi (2001), Koopman, Wang and Wei (2008), and Koopman, Powers, Wang and Wei (2010), Johnson and Noguera (forthcoming)
- These studies mainly rely on input-output tables at the sector level to assess foreign content in Chinese exports
- This paper takes a ground-up approach: we use transaction-level trade data and firm-level production data to assess the domestic value added in Chinese exports from 2000 to 2006

 Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS
- Operation of the export ratio of customs data to material to sales ratio of production data ⇒ weed out firms that specialized in importing or exporting

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS
- Output to export ratio of customs data to material to sales ratio of production data ⇒ weed out firms that specialized in importing or exporting
- Use the clean sample to compute a firm's domestic value added ratio (*DVAR*) of the year, which simply equals the ratio of net exports to gross exports at the firm level

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS
- Output to export ratio of customs data to material to sales ratio of production data ⇒ weed out firms that specialized in importing or exporting
- Use the clean sample to compute a firm's domestic value added ratio (*DVAR*) of the year, which simply equals the ratio of net exports to gross exports at the firm level
- Aggregate up all the firms in our clean sample to the HS 2 industries they are operating to calculate the industry *DVAR* based on the firms exports and imports data

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS
- Output to export ratio of customs data to material to sales ratio of production data ⇒ weed out firms that specialized in importing or exporting
- Use the clean sample to compute a firm's domestic value added ratio (*DVAR*) of the year, which simply equals the ratio of net exports to gross exports at the firm level
- Aggregate up all the firms in our clean sample to the HS 2 industries they are operating to calculate the industry DVAR based on the firms exports and imports data
- Use export weighted average of the industry *DVARs* to figure out the domestic value added of firms operating across multiple industries

A (10) A (10) A (10)

- Identify a set of firms that only participated in processing exports in a single HS 2-digit industry: all imports are used to produce processing exports within the industry
- Ø Merge these firms to their production data from China's NBS
- Output to export ratio of customs data to material to sales ratio of production data ⇒ weed out firms that specialized in importing or exporting
- Use the clean sample to compute a firm's domestic value added ratio (*DVAR*) of the year, which simply equals the ratio of net exports to gross exports at the firm level
- Aggregate up all the firms in our clean sample to the HS 2 industries they are operating to calculate the industry DVAR based on the firms exports and imports data
- Use export weighted average of the industry *DVARs* to figure out the domestic value added of firms operating across multiple industries

Aggregate up all firms to calculate domestic value added by export destinations

• Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006

- Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006
- Such increase is wide spread across HS-2 industries as well as across destination countries

- Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006
- Such increase is wide spread across HS-2 industries as well as across destination countries
- Firm level regressions confirm that export processing firms substitute imported materials with domestic materials which explains the rising *DVAR*

- Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006
- Such increase is wide spread across HS-2 industries as well as across destination countries
- Firm level regressions confirm that export processing firms substitute imported materials with domestic materials which explains the rising *DVAR*
- Rising DVAR is not driven by rising domestic production costs

- Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006
- Such increase is wide spread across HS-2 industries as well as across destination countries
- Firm level regressions confirm that export processing firms substitute imported materials with domestic materials which explains the rising *DVAR*
- Rising DVAR is not driven by rising domestic production costs
- This result suggests that China may be moving up the global production chain and is no longer only responsible for the final stage of productions

- Domestic value added in Chinese processing exports was around 50 percent in 2000, and it gradually increases to 62 percent in 2006
- Such increase is wide spread across HS-2 industries as well as across destination countries
- Firm level regressions confirm that export processing firms substitute imported materials with domestic materials which explains the rising *DVAR*
- Rising DVAR is not driven by rising domestic production costs
- This result suggests that China may be moving up the global production chain and is no longer only responsible for the final stage of productions
- However, foreign content remains high in Chinese exports ⇒ policy analysis based on gross trade flows will grossly overestimate the impact of Chinese exports

Data

Methodology

- Multiproduct firms
- 2 Negative domestic value added
- Results
- Conclusions

э

• The main data set covers the universe of Chinese import and export transactions in each month between 2000 and 2006

Data

- The main data set covers the universe of Chinese import and export transactions in each month between 2000 and 2006
- It reports values (in US dollars) of imports and exports at the HS 8-digit level (over 7000 products) from a firm to/from each country (over 200 destination and source countries)

Data

- The main data set covers the universe of Chinese import and export transactions in each month between 2000 and 2006
- It reports values (in US dollars) of imports and exports at the HS 8-digit level (over 7000 products) from a firm to/from each country (over 200 destination and source countries)
- We also use firm-level data from the annual surveys of industrial firms conducted by China's National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) for the 1998-2007 period

- The main data set covers the universe of Chinese import and export transactions in each month between 2000 and 2006
- It reports values (in US dollars) of imports and exports at the HS 8-digit level (over 7000 products) from a firm to/from each country (over 200 destination and source countries)
- We also use firm-level data from the annual surveys of industrial firms conducted by China's National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) for the 1998-2007 period
- The surveys cover all state-owned firms and all non-state-owned firms with sales above 5 million yuan

- The main data set covers the universe of Chinese import and export transactions in each month between 2000 and 2006
- It reports values (in US dollars) of imports and exports at the HS 8-digit level (over 7000 products) from a firm to/from each country (over 200 destination and source countries)
- We also use firm-level data from the annual surveys of industrial firms conducted by China's National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) for the 1998-2007 period
- The surveys cover all state-owned firms and all non-state-owned firms with sales above 5 million yuan
- The data set contains detailed information for about 100 variables, including firm ID, address, ownership, output, value added, four-digit industry code (480 categories), six-digit geographic code, exports, employment, original value of fixed asset, and intermediate inputs

Figure 1: Chinese exports by type, 2000-2006



2/11 12/32
Table 1: Top 10 Destinations for Chinese Processing Exports

	2000			2003			2006		
Rank		Share	\$ (Bil)		Share	\$ (Bil)		Share	\$ (Bil)
1	United States	0.25	25	United States	0.25	50.1	United States	0.25	113
2	Hong Kong	0.22	22.2	Hong Kong	0.23	44.6	Hong Kong	0.23	105
3	Japan	0.18	18.2	Japan	0.15	30.1	Japan	0.1	47.1
4	Korea	0.04	4.17	Germany	0.04	8.65	Germany	0.05	21.3
5	Germany	0.04	3.8	Netherlands	0.04	7.85	Netherlands	0.04	18.9
6	Singapore	0.03	3.17	Korea	0.04	7.81	Korea	0.04	18.2
7	Netherlands	0.03	3.07	Singapore	0.02	4.92	Singapore	0.03	12.8
8	UK	0.03	2.77	UK	0.02	4.81	UK	0.02	11.1
9	Taiwan	0.02	2.06	Taiwan	0.02	4.45	Taiwan	0.02	9.89
10	France	0.02	1.59	France	0.02	3.94	Malaysia	0.02	7.17
Total			101			198			449

1 13 / 32

Figure 2: Share of processing exports in top 10 destinations



Kee and Tang (WB and Tufts)

Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

2/11 14 / 32

Figure 3: Shares of processing exports in HS 2 industries



Kee and Tang (WB and Tufts)

Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

12/11 15 / 32

• Processing trade is wide spread across industries and export destinations

< 🗗 🕨

- ∢ ∃ ▶

э

- Processing trade is wide spread across industries and export destinations
- For many destinations, such as the US, processing trade is the main form of exports from China

- Processing trade is wide spread across industries and export destinations
- For many destinations, such as the US, processing trade is the main form of exports from China
- For many industries, such as Electronics, Transportation, Plastic Products, Toys, processing trade is the main form of exports from China

- Processing trade is wide spread across industries and export destinations
- For many destinations, such as the US, processing trade is the main form of exports from China
- For many industries, such as Electronics, Transportation, Plastic Products, Toys, processing trade is the main form of exports from China
- Given the high imported content in processing exports, any analysis based on gross trade flows can be highly misleading

• Start with a textbook identity, where the total revenue of a firm (PY), consists of the following components: profits, (π) , wages (wL), cost of capital (rK), cost of domestic material $(P^D M^D)$ and cost of imported material $(P^I M^I)$

$$PY = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D + P^I M^I$$

17 / 32

• Start with a textbook identity, where the total revenue of a firm (PY), consists of the following components: profits, (π) , wages (wL), cost of capital (rK), cost of domestic material $(P^D M^D)$ and cost of imported material $(P^I M^I)$

$$PY = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D + P^I M^I$$

• In theory, for processing trade firms,

PY = EXP $P^{I}M^{I} = IMP$

• Start with a textbook identity, where the total revenue of a firm (PY), consists of the following components: profits, (π) , wages (wL), cost of capital (rK), cost of domestic material $(P^D M^D)$ and cost of imported material $(P^I M^I)$

$$PY = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D + P^I M^I$$

• In theory, for processing trade firms,

$$PY = EXP$$
$$P^{I}M^{I} = IMP$$

• Hence domestic value added (*DVA*) for processing trade firms is $EXP - IMP = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D = DVA$

• Start with a textbook identity, where the total revenue of a firm (PY), consists of the following components: profits, (π) , wages (wL), cost of capital (rK), cost of domestic material $(P^D M^D)$ and cost of imported material $(P^I M^I)$

$$PY = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D + P^I M^I$$

• In theory, for processing trade firms,

$$PY = EXP$$
$$P^{I}M^{I} = IMP$$

• Hence domestic value added (DVA) for processing trade firms is

$$EXP - IMP = \pi + wL + rK + P^D M^D = DVA$$

• Domestic value added ratio (DVAR) is therefore

$$DVAR = \frac{DVA}{EXP} = \frac{EXP - IMP}{EXP} = 1 - \frac{IMP}{EXP}$$

• we assume that there is no imported content in domestic materials, such that $P^D M^D$ embodies purely domestic contents

- we assume that there is no imported content in domestic materials, such that P^DM^D embodies purely domestic contents
- We assume that imported materials have no Chinese contents, such that IMP is completely foreign made

- we assume that there is no imported content in domestic materials, such that P^DM^D embodies purely domestic contents
- We assume that imported materials have no Chinese contents, such that *IMP* is completely foreign made
 - If violated, the first assumption will lead to an over-estimation of DVA

- we assume that there is no imported content in domestic materials, such that P^DM^D embodies purely domestic contents
- We assume that imported materials have no Chinese contents, such that *IMP* is completely foreign made
 - If violated, the first assumption will lead to an over-estimation of DVA
 - If violated, the second assumption will lead to an under-estimation of *DVA*

- we assume that there is no imported content in domestic materials, such that P^DM^D embodies purely domestic contents
- We assume that imported materials have no Chinese contents, such that IMP is completely foreign made
 - If violated, the first assumption will lead to an over-estimation of DVA
 - If violated, the second assumption will lead to an under-estimation of *DVA*
 - The overall bias due to the two assumptions is not clear, but there is nothing we can do at this stage to assess the direction of bias.

• Above framework is helpful to figure out *DVAR* at firm level, but not useful for product level or industry level analysis

- Above framework is helpful to figure out *DVAR* at firm level, but not useful for product level or industry level analysis
- Majority of firms produce multiple products ⇒ not be possible to assign the imported materials to each of the HS 6 digit products a firm exports without knowing its firm level production structure

- Above framework is helpful to figure out *DVAR* at firm level, but not useful for product level or industry level analysis
- Majority of firms produce multiple products ⇒ not be possible to assign the imported materials to each of the HS 6 digit products a firm exports without knowing its firm level production structure
- Focus on the subset of export processing firms that only operate within a single HS 2 industry

- Above framework is helpful to figure out DVAR at firm level, but not useful for product level or industry level analysis
- Majority of firms produce multiple products ⇒ not be possible to assign the imported materials to each of the HS 6 digit products a firm exports without knowing its firm level production structure
- Focus on the subset of export processing firms that only operate within a single HS 2 industry
- Example of HS 2 industries: Woven apparel products (HS 62), Non-woven apparel product (HS 61), Footwear, gaiters and the like (HS 64), Electrical machinery and equipment and parts (HS 85), Toys, games and sports requisites (HS 95)

- Above framework is helpful to figure out *DVAR* at firm level, but not useful for product level or industry level analysis
- Majority of firms produce multiple products ⇒ not be possible to assign the imported materials to each of the HS 6 digit products a firm exports without knowing its firm level production structure
- Focus on the subset of export processing firms that only operate within a single HS 2 industry
- Example of HS 2 industries: Woven apparel products (HS 62), Non-woven apparel product (HS 61), Footwear, gaiters and the like (HS 64), Electrical machinery and equipment and parts (HS 85), Toys, games and sports requisites (HS 95)
- For these set of single HS 2 industry processing firms, all its imports are for exports within their HS 2 industry ⇒ estimate the average DVA for each HS 2 industry using the sample of single-HS2 exporters

• About 10% of single-industry firms have negative *DVA*, which is when imports >> exports

- About 10% of single-industry firms have negative DVA, which is when imports >> exports
- Two problems that may cause processing imports to be greater than processing exports within a firm in a given year

- About 10% of single-industry firms have negative DVA, which is when imports >> exports
- Two problems that may cause processing imports to be greater than processing exports within a firm in a given year
 - Leakage issues

- About 10% of single-industry firms have negative DVA, which is when imports >> exports
- Two problems that may cause processing imports to be greater than processing exports within a firm in a given year
 - Leakage issues
 - Inventory management

• Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms

< 67 ▶

- Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms
- Hence, processing imports can be larger than processing exports at firm level \Rightarrow *DVA* < 0

- Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms
- Hence, processing imports can be larger than processing exports at firm level \Rightarrow *DVA* < 0
- Merging the single-industry export processing firms to their production data collected by the census of manufacturing firms

- Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms
- Hence, processing imports can be larger than processing exports at firm level \Rightarrow *DVA* < 0
- Merging the single-industry export processing firms to their production data collected by the census of manufacturing firms
- Drop firms where there is excessive imports:

 $\frac{\textit{materials}}{\textit{revenue}} < \frac{\textit{IMP}}{\textit{EXP}}$

- Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms
- Hence, processing imports can be larger than processing exports at firm level \Rightarrow *DVA* < 0
- Merging the single-industry export processing firms to their production data collected by the census of manufacturing firms
- Drop firms where there is excessive imports:

$$\frac{materials}{revenue} < \frac{IMP}{EXP}$$

• For the remaining firms, we obtain the share of *DVA* in exports of the industries they operate in by summing up the imports and exports at HS 2 industry level

- Some single-industry export processing firms, while exporting, may import materials for other firms
- Hence, processing imports can be larger than processing exports at firm level \Rightarrow *DVA* < 0
- Merging the single-industry export processing firms to their production data collected by the census of manufacturing firms
- Drop firms where there is excessive imports:

$$\frac{materials}{revenue} < \frac{IMP}{EXP}$$

- For the remaining firms, we obtain the share of *DVA* in exports of the industries they operate in by summing up the imports and exports at HS 2 industry level
- For those firms that operate across multiple HS 2 industries, we apply the export weighted average *DVA* ratio of the industries they are in to obtain their firm level *DVA* ratio

• Current year processing imports may not be used fully for currently year processing exports, which causes $DV\!A < 0$

- Current year processing imports may not be used fully for currently year processing exports, which causes DVA < 0
- For those industries that use a lot of commodities based materials such as iron, copper and crude oil, firms have incentive to stock up imported materials when the international prices of such commodities are low in order to hedge again rising prices in the future

- Current year processing imports may not be used fully for currently year processing exports, which causes DVA < 0
- For those industries that use a lot of commodities based materials such as iron, copper and crude oil, firms have incentive to stock up imported materials when the international prices of such commodities are low in order to hedge again rising prices in the future
- No easy solutions

- Current year processing imports may not be used fully for currently year processing exports, which causes DVA < 0
- For those industries that use a lot of commodities based materials such as iron, copper and crude oil, firms have incentive to stock up imported materials when the international prices of such commodities are low in order to hedge again rising prices in the future
- No easy solutions
- But this may not be a big problem, as once we weed out firms with excessive imports, *DVA* are mostly positive

• Domestic value added share in total processing export was 50% in 2000

< /₽ > < E > <

-
- Domestic value added share in total processing export was 50% in 2000
- It has since risen to 62% in 2006

- Domestic value added share in total processing export was 50% in 2000
- It has since risen to 62% in 2006
- Rising DVAR is observed across industries and across destinations

Figure 5: Estimated average domestic value added ratio in Chinese exports



/11 24 / 32

Figure 6: Estimated domestic value added ratios by HS 2 industries



Kee and Tang (WB and Tufts)

Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

≣ ∽९९ 2/11 25/32

Figure 6: Distributions of domestic value added ratios



Kee and Tang (WB and Tufts) Domestic Value A

Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

12/11 26 / 32

Figure 7: Domestic value added vs capital intensity



27 / 32

 It could be due to rising production costs in China ⇒ China is losing competitiveness

- It could be due to rising production costs in China ⇒ China is losing competitiveness
- It could be because firms substitution imported materials with domestic materials ⇒ China is moving up the value added chain in global production network

Dependent variable: domestic value added ratio

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)
Sample	all	all	all	all	all	private	dom. private	foreign	High K/L	Low K/L
$\alpha_{2001} - \alpha_{2000}$	0.034***	0.033***	0.034***	0.034***	0.033***	0.033***	0.073**	0.031***	0.032**	0.032***
	(7.64)	(7.36)	(7.63)	(7.64)	(7.35)	(7.33)	(2.41)	(6.79)	(2.57)	(6.83)
$\alpha_{2002} - \alpha_{2000}$	0.044***	0.043***	0.044***	0.044***	0.043***	0.043***	0.061**	0.042***	0.049***	0.042***
	(9.52)	(9.19)	(9.50)	(9.52)	(9.16)	(9.12)	(2.09)	(8.96)	(3.77)	(8.48)
o	0.050***	0.058***	0.050***	0.050***	0.058***	0.058***	0.089***	0.057***	0.040***	0.057***
C42003 C42000	(12.26)	(11.88)	(12.23)	(12.28)	(11.85)	(11.83)	(2.68)	(11 40)	(3.45)	(11.02)
	(12.20)	(11.00)	(12.20)	(12.20)	(11.00)	(11.00)	(2.00)	(11.42)	(0.40)	(11.02)
$\alpha_{2004} - \alpha_{2000}$	0.059***	0.058***	0.059***	0.059***	0.058***	0.058***	0.080**	0.057***	0.042***	0.059***
	(11.97)	(11.56)	(11.94)	(11.96)	(11.52)	(11.51)	(2.57)	(11.09)	(2.83)	(11.14)
$\alpha_{2005} - \alpha_{2000}$	0.094***	0.093***	0.094***	0.094***	0.093***	0.093***	0.114***	0.092***	0.072***	0.093***
	(18.83)	(17.93)	(18.81)	(18.83)	(17.91)	(17.95)	(3.61)	(17.57)	(4.68)	(17.13)
·····	0 199***	0.199***	0.193***	0.192***	0.199***	0.199***	0.15/***	0.191***	0.105***	0.199***
C#2006 - C#2000	(23 77)	(22.36)	(23 73)	(23 77)	(22.32)	(22.33)	(4.85)	(21.52)	(6.42)	(21.13)
	(20.11)	(22.00)	(20.10)	(20.11)	(22.02)	(22.00)	(1.00)	(21.02)	(0.12)	(21110)
ln(wage rate)		0.002			0.002	0.002	-0.010	0.002	0.001	0.001
		(0.60)			(0.44)	(0.46)	(-0.61)	(0.43)	(0.15)	(0.13)
wage bill/Rev.			0.006		0.013	0.013	-0.028	0.016	0.003	0.016
			(0.83)		(0.66)	(0.65)	(-0.34)	(0.78)	(0.05)	(0.77)
Mat /Pau				0.000***	0.000***	0.000***	0.027	0.000***	0.000***	0.075***
widt./ rtev.				(-6.34)	(-6.44)	(-6.46)	(-0.83)	(-6.87)	(-20.10)	(-5.60)
N	54071	53205	54060	54071	53194	53046	6216	46154	8620	44574
R-sq	.0547	.0547	.0547	.0549	.055	.0553	.0486	.0573	.0368	.0718

Note: Firm and year fixed effects are always included. Data set: merged NBS and customs data. "High K/L" means all HS2 industries that have average In(K/L) above the median of all HS2. "Low K/L" includes all HS2 below the median.

Kee and Tang (WB and Tufts) Domestic Value Added in Chinese Exports

Dependent variable: import to material ratio

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
sample	all	all	all	all	all	private	dom. private	foreign
$\delta_{2001} - \delta_{2000}$	-0.026***	-0.026***	-0.026***	-0.027***	-0.027***	-0.027***	0.010	-0.028***
	(-6.00)	(-5.85)	(-6.06)	(-6.04)	(-6.17)	(-6.11)	(0.56)	(-6.01)
$\delta_{2002} - \delta_{2000}$	-0.040***	-0.040***	-0.040***	-0.039***	-0.041***	-0.041***	0.007	-0.043***
	(-8.27)	(-8.13)	(-8.42)	(-8.18)	(-8.55)	(-8.47)	(0.43)	(-8.50)
$\delta_{2003} - \delta_{2000}$	-0.059***	-0.059***	-0.060***	-0.060***	-0.061***	-0.061***	0.003	-0.064***
	(-11.81)	(-11.61)	(-11.96)	(-11.87)	(-11.96)	(-11.90)	(0.15)	(-11.94)
$\delta_{2004} - \delta_{2000}$	-0.059***	-0.059***	-0.060***	-0.060***	-0.061***	-0.061***	0.011	-0.064***
	(-10.98)	(-10.74)	(-11.12)	(-11.04)	(-11.15)	(-11.07)	(0.59)	(-11.15)
$\delta_{2005} - \delta_{2000}$	-0.089***	-0.089***	-0.090***	-0.089***	-0.090***	-0.090***	0.005	-0.095***
	(-16.15)	(-15.65)	(-16.26)	(-16.14)	(-15.83)	(-15.76)	(0.27)	(-16.05)
δ2006 - δ2000	-0.113***	-0.113***	-0.114***	-0.113***	-0.115***	-0.114***	-0.000	-0.123***
	(-19.68)	(-18.73)	(-19.73)	(-19.63)	(-19.09)	(-19.03)	(-0.00)	(-19.45)
ln(wage rate)		-0.003			-0.012***	-0.012***	-0.010	-0.012***
		(-0.86)			(-2.85)	(-2.87)	(-1.02)	(-2.63)
wage bill/Rev.			0.0389		0.208***	0.209***	0.106	0.212***
			(1.11)		(5.71)	(5.71)	(1.19)	(5.51)
$\ln(K/L)$				-0.008***	-0.004	-0.004	0.004	-0.006**
				(-2.96)	(-1.60)	(-1.61)	(0.46)	(-2.12)
N	54071	53205	54060	53862	53000	52853	6209	45070

• Regression results suggest that processing firms are substituting imported materials with domestic materials

- Regression results suggest that processing firms are substituting imported materials with domestic materials
- Evidence of China move up the value added chain and no longer only responsible for the final assembly of products

• We assess domestic value added in Chinese exports based on customs transaction data

→ Ξ →

-

- We assess domestic value added in Chinese exports based on customs transaction data
- Our results are similar to those existing papers that use aggregate input-output table

- We assess domestic value added in Chinese exports based on customs transaction data
- Our results are similar to those existing papers that use aggregate input-output table
- Domestic value added only consists of about 60 percent of Chinese exports

- We assess domestic value added in Chinese exports based on customs transaction data
- Our results are similar to those existing papers that use aggregate input-output table
- Domestic value added only consists of about 60 percent of Chinese exports
- Bilateral imbalance between US and China could be grossly overestimated based on gross trade figures