Tax administration options for fiscal sustainability

Graham Harrison
Fiscal Affairs Department

Tokyo, Wednesday, January 12, 2011
Session outline:

- **Broad context**
  - Fiscal adjustment and where tax admin fits in
  - Revenue possibilities from improved compliance

- **Tax administration options**
  - Priority actions
  - Medium-term reforms

- **Case studies**

- **Concluding remarks**
Broad context
Figure 1.1. Fiscal Balances, 2005–11
(Percent of GDP)

Source: October 2010 WEO and IMF staff calculations.

1 Cyclically adjusted data are not available for several countries.
Government debt...
Source: IMF Fiscal Monitor, Nov 2010

Figure 1.6. General Government Gross Debt Ratios
(Percent of GDP; 2009 PPP-GDP weighted average)

Source: IMF staff estimates based on October 2010 WEO projections.
Composition of adjustment...

- For countries with already high tax-to-GDP ratios, fiscal consolidation plans tend to tilt toward *expenditure* cuts.

- Countries with low tax ratios have more scope on the *revenue* side.

- Some countries with high adjustment needs will require both *revenue and expenditure* measures—Greece, US, and India, for example, therefore plan a broadly equal mix.
Composition of adjustment...

- On the revenue side, fiscal adjustment requires sound tax policy and efficient tax administration, especially to improve tax compliance.

- The adjustment plans of several countries therefore include admin measures to tackle tax evasion (Greece, India, Italy, Korea, Latvia, Portugal, and UK).

- This is important in terms of both equity and efficiency considerations, and the large existing margins to improve tax compliance.
Large tax gaps are widespread...

- VAT compliance gap (*difference between actual and potential VAT revenues*) is 20 percent or more in many countries (e.g. Mexico, Italy, Latvia, Greece)

- Revenue possibilities from closing the VAT gap are greater in emerging and developing economies:
  - Av. gap in emerging economies (21%)
  - Av. gap in advanced economies (13%)

Source: Published data from tax gap studies by EU, US, UK, Sweden, and some Latin American countries
Tax abuse is pervasive...

- **Shadow economy**
  - OECD country average (18%); Developing countries (38%); Schneider

- **Evasion, particularly by the self-employed**
  - Understated business earnings: Sweden 33%; Denmark 40%; US 50%

- **Aggressive tax planning**
  - $1.1 trillion of bank losses presents planning opportunities

- **Offshore tax abuse**
  - US Senate estimate of revenue losses $100bn per year (2008)

- **Tax fraud**
  - Estimated EU VAT refund fraud losses > $100bn (2006)

- **Unpaid tax debts**
  - Large debt inventories are common; 28% of GDP in an extreme case
Impact of crisis on tax compliance...

- The crisis has aggravated compliance problems
- Tax debts have grown—e.g., the UK VAT gap increased by 3 percentage points between 2008 and 2009, mostly due to a rise in unpaid VAT debts
- Filing compliance has deteriorated
- Several revenue agencies have observed a drift towards the shadow economy (Study estimates support this observation... Schneider)
- Concerns of resurgence of contrived tax schemes as the appetite for risk increases and corporations seek to restore financial positions
Priority actions
Priority actions to boost revenues...

- Implement tax policy measures effectively
- Tighten control over the largest taxpayers
- Restore filing and payment discipline
- Strengthen debt management
  - Including removal of collection impediments (esp. legal)
- Target evasion of high risk sectors
  - especially self-employed and high wealth individuals
- Enhance taxpayer assistance
Implement tax policy measures...

- Improved tax policy design can have positive spin-offs for tax administration and tax compliance—e.g. eliminating multiple VAT rates and exemptions removes system complexity and opportunities for abuse, thereby making administration easier.

- Implementation is most effective when there is:
  - Coordinated design of policy, legislation, and systems of administration
  - Tight project management of changes to systems and procedures; taxpayer education; monitoring of outcomes etc.
Tighter control of large taxpayers...

- In all countries, a handful of large taxpayers contribute most revenue

- Revenue can be safeguarded through:
  - Better understanding the revenue trends and emerging compliance risks of this key group
  - Close monitoring of filing and payment compliance; immediate follow-up where necessary
  - A risk-based audit program tailored to sectors and issues
  - Expanded taxpayer services, including a responsive rulings system
Restore filing discipline...

- Mainstay of compliance management; first step (after registration) in establishing tax liabilities
- Several examples where filing compliance deteriorated during the crisis
- Enforcement should be highly automated
- Some countries have developed profiling tools to predict the type of action most likely to get the desired response from the taxpayer
Strengthen debt management ...

- Debt management is too often the bridesmaid; rarely the bride

- Disparity in performance—OECD survey of 94 countries (pre-crisis):
  - Ratio of year-end tax debt: < 5% (18); 5%-10% (68); 10%-20% (4); > 20% (4)

- Arrears rose sharply during the crisis; more than doubled in some countries

- Collection impediments were exposed, esp. weaknesses in the law and judicial system
Target evasion of high risk groups...

- While compliance is very high (95% +) for taxes withheld at source or subject to regular third-party reporting... for other sources of income it is commonly very low.
  - US study (2006): More than 80% of income tax gap related to understated business earnings; evasion rates for proprietorship (sole trader) and rental income categories were close to 50%.
  - Swedish study (2008): understated business earnings estimated to be 33%.
  - Other tax gap studies (e.g. Denmark, UK).
Target evasion of high risk groups...

- Best practices include:
  - Intensified third-party reporting and data matching
  - Risk-based audit case selection
  - Audit visibility in risky sectors
  - Prosecution of worst offenders
  - Publicizing results and seeking wide community support for anti-evasion efforts
Enhance taxpayer assistance...

- Taxpayers have needed more help during the crisis, especially time payment arrangements.
- The challenge now is to manage a smooth exit from the special concessions introduced during the peak of the crisis.
- Focus should be on assistance that supports sustainable compliance.
Medium-term reforms
Medium-term reforms...

- Five key areas:
  - Building further capacity in core systems
  - Intensifying international collaboration
  - Developing comprehensive compliance programs
  - Strengthening legal frameworks
  - Exploiting new information technology

- These areas will be explored in detail in tomorrow’s session
Case studies
Case study A: the situation...

- Developed country with large fiscal adjustment needs
- Revenue efficiency much lower than that of counterparts—(5.5 points of GDP lower)
- Large VAT gap (30 percent) and well above regional average (12 percent)
- Large informal economy (estimated 25% +)
- Income tax evasion high, especially with self-employed professionals
- Very high and growing tax arrears
- Administration fundamentals in need of reform
Case study A: the response...

- A two-pronged strategy, comprising:
  - A targeted anti-evasion plan to produce extra revenue during the next 12–18 months from immediate intensified actions to control tax abuse
  - A structural reform program aimed at producing extra revenue in the medium-term through fundamental changes in tax administration to secure enduring compliance
Case study A: anti-evasion plan...

- **Intensified efforts in five key areas:**
  - Centrally managed implementation of policy/legislative package (includes a number of anti-evasion measures)
  - Special collection task force focused on largest tax debts
    - involves coordinated collection of tax and social security debts; removal of legal impediments to collection; and streamlining judicial processes
  - High profile unit established to administer top 1,000 taxpayers
  - Targeted offensive on blatant tax evaders
    - self-employed and wealthy individuals exhibiting high risk of noncompliance
  - Systematic (not *ad hoc*) enforcement of filing and payment
Case study A: medium-term structural reforms...

- Comprehensive modernization of the revenue agency to implement:
  - New organizational structure
  - Modern HRM practices
  - Revamped headquarters
  - Strategic planning and risk management
  - Redeveloped core processes
  - Automated collection systems
  - etc
Case study B: the situation...

- Country in emerging Europe
- Deep recession—real GDP fell by 18% year-on-year in 2009
- Collapse in revenues—tax revenues dropped by 3½% of GDP
- Large fiscal adjustment needs
- Pre-existing VAT gap of 22 percent
- Moderately large shadow economy
- Rapid escalation of tax arrears
Case study B: the situation...

- Relatively sound revenue agency (high level of automation—e-filing around 90 percent; well-qualified staff; modern office facilities) but...

  operating budget drastically cut (salaries cut by 30%; staff numbers reduced by 15%; capital works program halted)
Case study B: the response...

- Immediate priority was to redirect resources to:
  - Assist distressed businesses (time payment arrangements for viable businesses with temporary cash-flow problems; timely VAT refunds)
  - Contain the rise in tax debts
  - Expand the large taxpayer unit to increase coverage from 40% to 65% of total domestic tax collections
  - Increase audit presence through use of a wider range of audit types, particularly single-issue and desk audits
- Next step was to develop a comprehensive risk-driven compliance strategy structured around key taxpayer segments
Case study B: the response...

- Medium-term reform effort:
  - Building revenue analysis and risk assessment capability
  - Streamlining operations by reducing the number of local tax offices
  - Centralizing debt collection and taxpayer services functions, and bringing stronger central management to audit operations
  - Revamping key collection processes and systems, especially debt collection and VAT refund processing
  - Simplifying administration of small taxpayers
Concluding remarks
Thank you