Phoenix Miracles in Emerging Markets: Recovering without credit from systemic financial crises.

By
Guillermo Calvo
Alejandro Izquierdo
Ernesto Talvi

Discussion by
Roberto Rigobon

The views expressed in this paper are those of the author(s) only, and the presence of them, or of links to them, on the IMF website does not imply that the IMF, its Executive Board, or its management endorses or shares the views expressed in the paper.
What the profession has been doing?

- Years studying crises
  - Causes, predictions, mechanisms, equilibrium, etc.

- CIT study the recoveries
  - Recoveries are extremely fast
  - Recoveries occur without credit expansions
  - Therefore, it takes place in the absence of formal financial markets.
What do they find?

- Summary of the patterns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Crises</th>
<th>Recoveries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFP</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>~</td>
<td>~</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>~</td>
<td>~</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>~</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is “recovery”? 

- Recovery to the potential output 
- Recovery to previous output level
Which Crises?

• Crises where there is a closure of international inflows – sudden stops.

• Deflationary crises (Great Depression) seem to have some common components, except for inflation and depreciation

• Could pure fiscal crises be different?
What are the possibilities?

- Maybe we have overestimated the importance of the financial sector.
- Maybe the financial sector is important only in downturns.
- Maybe firms use informal financial markets during the recovery.
- Maybe there is some sort of “real overshooting” during recessions due to reorganization.
Can be related to lack of default cost?

- Defaults do not seem to be as costly as we thought. Recent papers by
  - Kaminsky studying the behavior of bond and loans issuances
  - Della Paolera and Taylor studying the boom and default cycles since the 1800’s
  - Panizza and Levy-Yeyati studying the output loss of defaults find that most of the cost occurs before the default.
Final comments

• I liked the paper a lot.
• I think the stylized fact seems robust, and it is very interesting.
• It is questioning the consensus.

• I would like to have seen a full anatomy of the recoveries.
  – Three different crises (sudden stops, deflation, and fiscal)
  – Two different definitions of recovery (previous and potential)

• Further research is required.